

**CityNet (Lawson e-Recruiting)
January 2009**

Patrice Randle, City Auditor
Craig Terrell, Assistant City Auditor
Roshan Jayawardene, Internal Auditor



City Auditor's Office

January 23, 2009

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council:

I am pleased to present the City Auditor's Office's report on CityNet (Lawson e-Recruiting). Lawson e-Recruiting is the system used by the City to manage the job application process. The purpose of the audit was to evaluate the adequacy of internal controls in the Lawson e-Recruiting system and ensure data accuracy and data integrity within the application.

Management concurs with eight of our audit findings and related recommendations but did not concur with the remaining two. Management's responses to our audit findings and recommendations, as well as target implementation dates and responsibilities, are included in the following report. Within twelve months, the City Auditor's Office will conduct a follow-up audit and comment on management's implementation of these audit recommendations.

We would like to thank City staff for their cooperation and assistance during this project. We look forward to continuing our efforts to ensure that adequate controls exist within implemented systems and that those systems meet the business needs of the City.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads 'Patrice Randle'.

Patrice Randle, CPA
City Auditor

- c: Jim Holgersson, City Manager
- Fiona Allen, Deputy City Manager
- Bob Byrd, Deputy City Manager
- Gilbert Perales, Deputy City Manager
- Trey Yelverton, Deputy City Manager
- Louis Carr, Chief Information Officer
- Joyce Williams, Workforce Services Director

CityNet (Lawson e-Recruiting) Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
Executive Summary	1
Audit Scope and Methodology.....	2
Background.....	3
Detailed Audit Findings.....	5

CityNet (Lawson e-Recruiting)



Office of the City Auditor

Patrice Randle, CPA
City Auditor

Project #07-15.3

January 23, 2009

Executive Summary

The Lawson e-Recruiting system is capable of processing job applications

Job applicants can view and apply for open positions online

Key features of the software do not work as intended:

- *reporting*
- *interface to the Lawson human resources system*

Opportunities for Improvement

- *Establish a test environment*
- *Analysis to ensure system setup per vendor criteria*
- *Verify accuracy of system-generated reports*
- *Analysis to determine system scalability*

As part of the Fiscal Year 2008 Annual Audit Plan, the City Auditor's Office has conducted an audit of CityNet Lawson e-Recruiting, a web-based recruitment system used by City management to process job applications. Lawson e-Recruiting is part of CityNet, a shared service enterprise resource planning (ERP) solution for the financial management and human resources information systems. The audit was conducted in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. The City Auditor's Office reviewed the Lawson e-Recruiting system to ensure that the application is meeting the business needs of the City of Arlington and is scalable for future hiring needs. The audit included objectives to determine whether:

- Adequate audit trails exist for critical transactions
- Lawson e-Recruiting was available to potential job applicants with minimal downtime
- Sensitive job applicant data, such as social security numbers, is secured
- Access to sensitive data is based on job requirements
- Lawson e-Recruiting is compliant with labor laws and provides reporting in accordance with Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) laws

Overall, the Lawson e-Recruiting application is capable of accepting and processing job applications for vacant positions. Although the system is functional, several key functions are not working as intended and the City Auditor's Office identified several opportunities for improvement. For example, the City Auditor's Office noted that system-generated reports are not reliable and that the interface between Lawson e-Recruiting and other Lawson modules does not work as intended. In addition, a test environment does not exist and there is a need to ensure that the system is scalable for future needs.

The results of the audit are included in the Detailed Audit Findings section of this report.

Audit Scope and Methodology

The City Auditor's Office reviewed activity and data entered into the Lawson e-Recruiting system since its inception (January 2006) through August 2008.

The following methodology was used in completing the audit.

- Interviewed management and staff associated with system operations
- Gained an understanding of system operations by reviewing sample transactions
- Examined audit trails and internal controls for critical activity
- Surveyed hiring managers and job applicants who use Lawson e-Recruiting
- Examined the Lawson e-Recruiting system's ability to comply with labor laws and produce reports to comply with EEOC requirements

Audit testing was limited due to the absence of a test environment. Even though the City's Information Technology (IT) Department discussed the possibility of a test environment with Velocity Technology Solutions (service vendor), it was cost prohibitive. Limited testing was, therefore, conducted in the live production environment. Due to the testing limitation, the City Auditor's Office utilized the e-Recruiting setup instructions published by Lawson and reviewed Arlington's Lawson e-Recruiting problem tickets to assess the current operational environment for Lawson e-Recruiting in Arlington. In addition, the City Auditor's Office observed Lawson e-Recruiting at the City of Carrollton. Although the City of Carrollton processes less application volume, the City Auditor's Office determined that the City of Carrollton could be benchmarked for application setup because they have experienced fewer system errors and have configured the system to vendor specifications.

Background

Lawson e-Recruiting was implemented by Lawson, with assistance from the North Central Texas Council of Governments (NCTCOG). Lawson e-Recruiting processes job applications for internal and external job candidates. The Lawson e-Recruiting application is also implemented in the cities of Carrollton and Grand Prairie, which are members of the shared services agreement with the City of Arlington. Consultants who were contracted by the NCTCOG implemented components of Lawson in the three cities. At the time of implementation, involvement by each city's IT Department was limited to infrastructure support. Currently, each city's IT department provides assistance in resolving technical problems and ensures the operability of Lawson components installed at their city.

Lawson e-Recruiting went live at the City of Arlington in February 2006. The NCTCOG provided technical support, with vendor assistance. In July 2007, the NCTCOG outsourced the task of resolving system problems and assisting users with system functionality to Velocity. Tasks conducted by NCTCOG are currently limited to contractual matters and managing the subcontract with Velocity. During system implementation, key staff members from the Financial Services and Workforce Services Departments were responsible for system setup from a user perspective and training users.

A key component in Lawson e-Recruiting is the job template, which is customized for each job position. The job template consists of five sections, as listed below.

1. Main Selection – basic data such as job title, work location and desired minimum educational qualifications
2. Experience – desired experience for the advertised position
3. Knowledge, Skill and Abilities – desired skills, and ability to perform tasks specific to the advertised position
4. Area of Study – desired educational background and coursework applicable for the advertised position
5. Certifications – desired certifications specific to the advertised position

Attributes listed in each section are prompted for candidates to answer when applying for a job. Hiring managers can use the template to assign weights for each category. A highly desired skill set, such as a college degree or experience, can be weighted higher than other categories. Therefore, when candidates with higher qualifications apply, their applications can be ranked higher among job applicants, making it easier for the recruiter to identify those that appear to be the most qualified.

The Lawson e-Recruiting application supports the “career opportunities” webpage, accessed directly from the City of Arlington website. Both internal and external job candidates have to access the webpage in order to apply. Job applicants are required to first select the job(s) for which they wish to apply and establish a profile. Once the profile is completed, the job application is sent to the job requisition. Applicants can access the password-protected profile to update and apply for future jobs.

Administratively, the Lawson e-Recruiting application offers a variety of tools for consultants within the Workforce Services Department. It offers a limited amount of reporting for EEOC requirements, as required by the Department of Labor. EEOC guidelines require fair hiring practices for open positions to all qualified applicants.

The Lawson e-Recruiting application was intended to interface with Lawson, transferring applicant data to payroll and human resource modules in Lawson after a job applicant is hired for the position. After the data transfer, Lawson e-Recruiting was intended to close out the job requisition and conclude the hiring process with minimal human intervention.

Satisfaction among Lawson e-Recruiting users remains low. System errors have forced Workforce Services staff to adapt workarounds or manual processes. Administrative users, such as Workforce Services staff, cited the following traits as unsatisfactory.

- Inability for Lawson e-Recruiting to reliably interface with Lawson
- Inability to send qualified applications to hiring managers via email
- Inability to rank job applications in a reliable, verifiable manner
- Loss of data, when applications are updated
- Loss of data, resulting in gaps in candidate job history
- System permits an applicant to update or attach a document to the profile, after a job is removed from publishing
- Slow system performance
- Unreliable system-generated reports, which makes it difficult for Workforce Services management to determine operational status

A survey of newly hired staff members who used Lawson e-Recruiting to submit their applications, rated the system as acceptable. Survey components included web site availability, ability to update the job application and login features. A survey of hiring managers indicated dissatisfaction with the system's inability to rank job applicants based on reported skills, causing the hiring managers to review a large volume of applications.

Detailed Audit Findings

1. The City of Arlington does not have access to a Lawson e-Recruiting test environment.

Test environments are necessary to enable IT staff to troubleshoot applications and test application patches and fixes prior to production implementation. Most other applications utilized by the City of Arlington (COA) include a test environment. Lawson maintenance functions are outsourced to Velocity, a firm based in Florida. Velocity maintains a test environment, but COA users do not have access to the test system. As a result, users are unable to troubleshoot the application, test job templates or conduct user testing of any fixes or enhancements to the system. Trouble tickets for Lawson e-Recruiting are forwarded to Velocity. During the audit, two trouble tickets remained unresolved due to Velocity's inability to duplicate the reported problem.

The IT Department considered a test environment prior to the Lawson e-Recruiting audit, but was unable to obtain one due to funding limitations. Testing conducted by the City Auditor's Office was therefore limited. The City Auditor's Office was informed that during system implementation, the cost of software and infrastructure components to support a second set of servers for the application was not budgeted.

Recommendation:

The Chief Information Officer, in conjunction with the Workforce Services Director, should consult with the NCTCOG to establish a test environment.

Management's Response:

Concur. A formal [Lawson] eRecruiting TEST environment was established, configured, and deployed by Velocity Technology Solutions, the City's Lawson host provider, during the October-November 2008 timeframe and was made available to the City for use beginning November 25th, 2008.

Target Date: Completed - November 2008
Responsibility: Information Technology (IT) Manager

2. The Lawson e-Recruiting interface to Lawson is not operating as intended.

The request for proposal (RFP) included a requirement for an interface with the Lawson human resources and payroll modules. Such an interface is necessary to ensure that information gathered during the recruitment process is accurately and efficiently transferred to other system modules. The Lawson e-Recruiting interface is intended to send and receive data to/from the Lawson human resources and payroll modules. The data intended to be sent to Lawson includes new job applicant information and activation of payroll for newly hired employees. The data that should be sent to Lawson e-Recruiting from Lawson includes closure of the job requisition, after the hiring process is complete.

Workforce Services management has discontinued its use of the limited one-way interface in Lawson e-Recruiting due to lack of reliability and limitations in the interface itself. Because the interface between Lawson e-Recruiting and the Lawson human resources information system

does not work as intended, the COA enters data manually into the human resources system and performs manual requisition close-outs in Lawson e-Recruiting. The inoperable interface results in manual processes that are time-consuming and increase staff's workload.

The City Auditor's Office was unable to determine the exact cause of interface failure. Paradigm Business Solutions, a vendor involved in the Lawson e-Recruiting implementation, stated that interface malfunctions encountered during system implementation were rectified by Lawson programming staff.

The City of Carrollton has also encountered malfunctions with Lawson's e-Recruiting interface to Lawson. According to Carrollton human resources personnel, the software vendor had dedicated consultants to make the interface operational. As a result, the interface in Carrollton is operational and reliable as a one-way interface, where data is transferred from Lawson e-Recruiting to populate data fields in Lawson.

Recommendation:

The Chief Information Officer should require Lawson to provide a reliable, operational interface between Lawson e-Recruiting and the Lawson human resources module.

Management's Response:

Concur. The City's IT Department is currently working with Velocity Technology Solutions to install an updated version of the [Lawson] eRecruiting/Lawson interface, recently made available by Lawson, into the City's eRecruiting TEST environment. Testing of this updated interface should be able to commence within the late January or early February 2009 timeframe.

Target Date: September 30, 2009
Responsibility: Information Technology (IT) Manager

3. Job applicant social security numbers are not encrypted or masked.

Job applications that are sent to hiring managers include applicant social security numbers that are listed in plain view. An applicant has the choice not to include the social security number in the job application, but when provided, the numbers are not encrypted or masked. As a method of preventing identity theft and misuse of personal information, sensitive information that is not part of selecting a job applicant should be excluded.

Social security numbers are recorded in the Lawson human resources system after a candidate is hired. The current Lawson e-Recruiting application includes a setting to mask the first five digits of an applicant's social security number. However, that feature is not activated. Job applications are reviewed by many City employees during the interview process, revealing sensitive information.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director should ensure that applicant social security numbers are masked.

Management's Response:

Concur. Detailed analysis of the [Lawson] eRecruiting set-up will be performed, as it is presently unclear as to whether or not social security numbers can be encrypted or masked. Until such time as the software's ability to perform this function is verified, the [Lawson] eRecruiting software set-up will be modified to remove the SSN field so that an applicant cannot enter that particular piece of information into the system themselves.

Target Date: March 31, 2009

Responsibility: Workforce Services Operations Manager

4. The data field for the job posting ending date should be mandatory.

As a measure of good customer service and maintaining accuracy, advertised job positions should be removed from job postings when filled. During the review of job postings, the City Auditor's Office noted that a job initially posted on March 6, 2008 and filled on June 2, 2008 was still posted as of July 25, 2008. The City continued to receive applications for the position, even though the position had been filled.

The current job posting process does not require a posting ending date. The application allows the data field to be left blank during the job posting process. As a result, jobs remain posted and applicants continue to apply jobs that are non-existent, resulting in the receipt of additional applications and an increased processing workload for consultants.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director should consider an automated or manual control to ensure a posting end date is entered in each job requisition.

Management's Response:

Concur. This change was recently implemented by Workforce Services staff as a standard operating practice.

Target Date: Completed – November 2008

Responsibility: Workforce Services Operations Manager

5. Job posting periods are lengthy.

The City Auditor's Office noted that some jobs were posted on the City's website for lengthy periods, as noted in the table below.

Department	Position	Months Open
Convention Center	Event Coordinator	6
Information Technology	Customer Support Specialist	4
Convention Center	Assistant Director	4
Workforce Services	Consultant	4
Community Services	Community Services Supervisor	2
Municipal Court	Clerk	2

Lengthy postings have produced an excessive number of job applications for the positions. Advertised positions at the Convention Center produced 774 applications for the Event Coordinator position and 508 applications for the Assistant Director position. The Workforce Services Consultant posting resulted in 661 applications. The large volume of applications makes the selection process difficult to manage.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director should consider establishing procedures that would require jobs to be posted for shorter durations.

Management's Response:

Do Not Concur. The duration of a job posting is determined by the hiring manager. This decision is based on a combination of factors, including but not limited to, the size of the labor pool for a particular position and the complexity of the knowledge, skills and abilities required to perform the job.

Target Date: Not Applicable

Responsibility: Not Applicable

6. The City does not utilize the candidate scoring and ranking system within Lawson e-Recruiting.

During the initial RFP process, the City listed the ability to score and rank job candidates as a required feature of the proposed recruiting system. Although the Lawson e-Recruiting system includes such a scoring system, Workforce Services management does not currently believe that the system results in an accurate ranking of candidates. Organizations should utilize automated recruiting technology to pre-screen candidates for minimum qualifications and rank candidates from most to least qualified. Without this ability, the process of manually sorting through applications delays getting qualified candidates to hiring managers. The City Auditor's Office noted the following as possible reasons the scoring system does not result in accurate rankings.

▪ **Some required skills and minimum qualifications for job postings are not reflected in the job templates.**

Job skills and minimum qualifications for advertised positions are listed in the job description. The City Auditor's Office noted that required skills and minimum qualifications were not always listed in the Lawson e-Recruiting job template. For example, although a Bachelor's degree was listed as a minimum qualification for the Treasury Manager position,

a high school diploma was listed in the job template. Although prior convention/trade show/hotel experience was a minimum qualification for an Event Coordinator position, the job template listed only prior public assembly experience as a qualification. The job application on the City of Arlington's website lists each desired job qualification from the job template for the applicant to respond. Applicant rankings are based on the responses placed in the job template.

Job templates in Lawson e-Recruiting are customized for each position at the City of Arlington. As observed in the Lawson e-Recruiting setup instructions, the desired job skills are required to be listed and weighted in the job template. The instructions show that Lawson e-Recruiting is capable of ranking the job applicants. In reference to the Treasury Manager position mentioned above, the system ranked a candidate with a high school diploma higher than a candidate with a college degree.

- **Job templates are set on default weight categories.**

A primary feature of Lawson e-Recruiting is its capacity to rank job applicants, based on how well they purport to meet job requirements. Users in both Arlington and Carrollton state that the applicant score does not give the highest score to the most qualified candidate. As a result, the City of Arlington has discontinued the use of the candidate score. When job templates are set up in accordance to Lawson guidelines and weighted appropriately, Carrollton users have found that Lawson e-Recruiting ranks the most qualified applicants near the top of the entire applicant pool, based on information entered by candidates.

As stated on the Lawson e-Recruiting set up instructions, in order for the ranking to be more accurate, each job requirement needs to be weighted, based on how critical it is to each position. When job requirements are ranked equally, an applicant with a desired skill such as a Master's degree or certification will not be easily identifiable among the applicant pool. A majority of the job templates examined by the City Auditor's Office were weighted at the default value of "10". For example, the Payroll Accountant job template consisted of 12 skills/abilities, 12 experience categories, and one area of study category, all weighted at "10". The most desired skills and abilities were not assigned a greater weight. Although 805 applications were received, the hiring manager for the Payroll Accountant position noted that only eight applicants appeared to be qualified out of a pool of 104 sent for review. Due to lack of a test environment, the City Auditor's Office was unable to conduct testing to determine if weighting desired skills would assist in the applicant ranking process.

The City Auditor's Office noted that the City of Carrollton increased the weighting factor for critical job requirements/skills. The City of Carrollton stated that they also examined required skills for all positions to ensure the skills were valid and applicable to the job position, prior to system implementation. As discovered during interviews of Arlington Workforce Services' staff, such analysis was not conducted during Arlington's Lawson e-Recruiting implementation. Job analysis would ensure that current job skills in each position are accurate, valid, necessary and weighted accordingly.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director should ensure that current job templates are reviewed to determine if listed job skills for each position are accurate, valid, necessary and weighted accordingly. The Workforce Services Director should then test the scoring system to determine if the changes result in more accurate rankings.

Management's Response:

Do Not Concur. Prior use of and experience with the [Lawson] eRecruiting software and its scoring system have revealed limitations in the software's ability to adequately marry the scoring system to the skill requirements for a position and the job history/experience provided by candidates applying for a position. For example, a position may require a Bachelor's degree and an applicant says he or she has a Master's degree. The [Lawson] eRecruiting system does not recognize the fact that a Master's degree is a higher educational achievement level than a Bachelor's degree. Consequently, the system would score the educational requirement portion of the application as a zero. Also, [Lawson] eRecruiting does not have built-in functionality for verifying an applicant's claimed skills and abilities, and does not verify those items against the applicant's listed work experience.

Target Date: Not Applicable

Responsibility: Not Applicable

Audit Comment:

The audit recommendation suggests that the job templates be set in accordance with vendor specifications. During observations at the City of Carrollton, the City Auditor's Office noted that when templates are set in accordance to vendor specifications and weighted based on individual skills, applicants with higher qualifications are ranked higher. For example, the e-Recruiting application can only rank a candidate with a Masters degree higher than a Bachelor degree, if the obtainment of a Masters degree is weighted higher than a Bachelors degree.

Because a test system was unavailable during the audit, the City Auditor's Office was unable to conduct testing to determine whether the e-Recruiting application is capable of ranking job candidates. In addition, job templates examined by the City Auditor's Office deviated from vendor setup instructions. Subsequent to completion of City Auditor's Office fieldwork, a test system became available. The City Auditor's Office believes that the test environment should be utilized to determine whether the e-Recruiting candidate ranking functionality can be used effectively.

7. Job application coding during the job requisition closeout process is not complete.

The job requisition closeout process, after a candidate is hired, includes coding the selected candidate as "hired". During the closeout process, Workforce Services consultants may use one of several codes to reflect the hiring status. Some available options include "selected other candidate," "rejection letter sent" or "rejected, does not meet qualifications." When an option is not selected, candidates remain coded as "applied".

Analysis conducted by the City Auditor's Office identified closed out job requisitions that still had applicants coded as "applied". If a potential candidate were to request information under the Texas Public Information Act, he or she might question whether the City considered their application for that position.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director should ensure that applicants are coded appropriately, to reflect consideration for posted positions.

Management's Response:

Concur. Letters of rejection that are sent to job applicants will be simplified in order to reflect a more generic response, with the specific reasons for rejection to be held by the specific hiring managers. This approach is being taken due to the [Lawson] eRecruiting software's inability to list more than one reason for rejection in the response letter.

Target Date: March 1, 2009

Responsibility: Workforce Services Operations Manager

8. Analysis to assess Lawson e-Recruiting application setup and its scalability is warranted.

During system implementation, Lawson provided the City with an administrative manual to guide staff through system configuration. In order to ensure optimal system functionality, systems should be setup in accordance with vendor specifications and adequately tested to ensure scalability to future needs.

During the audit, Workforce Services management expressed concerns about the ability of Lawson e-Recruiting to process daily transactions reliably and to process the total volume of applications that are received by the COA. User dissatisfaction and frustrations have led Workforce Services management to consider replacing the Lawson e-Recruiting application. In addition, Workforce Services staff indicated that system errors have forced them to adapt workarounds or manual processes. For example, staff manually prepares reports required by the EEOC, although the Lawson e-Recruiting system was designed to generate the reports.

Due to lack of documentation, the City Auditor's Office was unable to determine if Lawson e-Recruiting had been subjected to a load test analysis prior to implementation. Such a test would have determined the system's ability to process a given volume of transactions.

The City Auditor's Office noted deviations in system setup, compared to setup instructions published by the vendor. Benchmarking best practices in the City of Carrollton also show variations in system setup. Lack of a test environment prevents users from troubleshooting the application or testing job templates, etc. in order to determine if they function as intended.

Given the complexity of an enterprise wide system, replacing just one component in the enterprise wide system has to be approached cautiously. Compatibility within Lawson, shared services plan, hardware needs, application servicing and maintenance has to be considered prior to replacement of Lawson e-Recruiting. The first step in determining if Lawson e-Recruiting is

capable of meeting Arlington's needs is to assess if the application is currently set up in accordance with vendor specifications. This analysis would require vendor assistance and subsequent testing of the system to determine functionality and scalability to a given processing volume.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director, in coordination with the Chief Information Officer, should conduct an analysis to determine if Lawson e-Recruiting is set up to vendor specifications and to determine its scalability to future processing volumes.

Management's Response:

Concur. In November 2008, Information Technology partnered with Workforce Services to begin a complete evaluation of the [Lawson] eRecruiting software. As part of the evaluation process, the original system configuration will be reviewed and compared with current business requirements to determine if changes to business processes and/or the software itself are needed. Additionally, the City will consult with the other partner cities in the Shared Services initiative, as well as with other Lawson eRecruiting customers, to review their use of the product in order to identify possible opportunities for improvement to our use of the software.

Target Date: September 30, 2009
Responsibility: Workforce Services Operations Manager
Information Technology (IT) Manager

9. System test information was not available.

The City Auditor's Office noted that Lawson Lawson e-Recruiting test scripts, during system implementation, did not indicate test results for key areas of system functionality. For example, the scripts did not indicate whether the application was able to effectively e-mail job applications to hiring managers. The inability to e-mail job applications is a key complaint among system users.

Test scripts are designed to test functionality of system features during the implementation stage. The scripts require documentation of test results in detail. If the tests fail, vendor involvement to assess application code and documentation of corrective actions plans is required. The system development lifecycle process requires user acceptance testing per international guidelines, such as guidelines set forth by the International Standards Organization (ISO) for software testing.

The IT Department was unable to locate system test data for Lawson e-Recruiting. As shown on the test scripts, Workforce Services staff was responsible for system testing. Some test scripts provided to the City Auditor's Office state "functioning as intended" in the results section, but did not provide any other details. Review of error tickets submitted to Velocity show malfunctions in the same areas that lack documented test results, such as the inability to e-mail applications.

Recommendation:

The Chief Information Officer and the Workforce Services Director should ensure that system user acceptance test results are documented in detail and retained.

Management's Response:

Concur. An IT Project Management Office (PMO) was formally established in the fall of 2007. The PMO is responsible for the documentation and retention of software test results at all stages of the formal testing process (unit, system/integration, and user acceptance testing).

Target Date: Completed - Spring 2008
Responsibility: Information Technology PMO Manager

10. Reports generated by the Lawson e-Recruiting application need to be validated

The EEOC is a federal governmental agency that oversees enforcement of anti-discrimination laws in employment practices. Several laws, such as the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, the Equal Pay Act of 1963 and the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 prohibit discriminatory hiring practices. In response to a complaint, employers may be required to provide various statistical data regarding job applicants. The EEO reports are intended to identify and compile demographic data of job applicants. The EEOC reporting requirement was listed in the system requirements section of the request for proposal, which the vendor responded to as being compliant.

Job applicants may quit the COA's electronic job application process prior to completing the job application. Applicants may also enter required data, but choose not to enter voluntary EEO data which appears at the end of the application process. The Lawson e-Recruiting EEO report is unreliable and must be validated to ensure accuracy. It does not indicate the number of job candidates that did not complete the application process and does not include the number of candidates that chose not to respond to EEO questions. Lawson e-Recruiting records for an Animal Services Officer position showed a total of 107 job applicants, but the EEO report for the same position only showed data such as race, citizenship and gender for 75 applicants. EEO data for the remaining 32 applicants is unknown.

Currently, Workforce Services staff members rely on an outside reporting tool to extract data from a database dump provided to Workforce Services by Velocity. The data is then extracted with another query tool, such as Microsoft Access or Crystal Reports.

In addition to EEO reports, the Lawson e-Recruiting application is capable of producing reports on recruiting activity. A total of 14 reports are currently listed in the report menu, ranging from gathering applicant data, job requisition information, retrieving archived applicant data and job publishing information.

A report generated by the City Auditor's Office should have only included job requisitions for calendar year 2007. However, the report included job postings made by a Workforce Services Consultant who was not employed by the COA in 2007. The number of candidates presented in the system-generated job requisition report did not match the number of candidates on a similar

report manually generated by the Workforce Services Department. Workforce Services management has also stated that the candidate referral source report consists of errors, making the report unreliable.

Workforce Services management has discontinued the use of reports generated by Lawson e-Recruiting as a result of noticeable errors. As a result, management is unable to assess operational status or efficiency of their recruiting efforts. The RFP listed many system tracking (reporting) requirements, including the ability to track job requisitions, applicants and hired candidates. The vendor responded that the proposed system was capable of providing the required tracking information.

The City Auditor's Office was unable to determine root causes of reporting errors due to the absence of a test environment. Determining the root cause(s) of the reporting inaccuracies would require a test environment set up to vendor specifications and reconciling the reports back to the data source.

Recommendation:

The Workforce Services Director should ensure testing is conducted to assess accuracy of the system-generated reports by reconciling back to source data. The vendor should be required to amend Lawson e-Recruiting, based on test results, in order to produce accurate system-generated reports.

Management's Response:

Concur. Custom reports will be created and executed, comparing the results with those of the [Lawson] eRecruiting system-generated reports. Discrepancies will [be] identified and reviewed to determine if they are the result of initial report set-up or if they are, in fact, the result of logic problems within the reports themselves. Any issues that are identified as system problems will be reported to Velocity/Lawson for investigation and remediation.

Target Date: October 1, 2009
Responsibility: Workforce Services Operations Manager